

## Review

# The effect of smoking on periodontal treatment response: a review of clinical evidence

L. Heasman, F. Stacey,  
P. M. Preshaw, G. I. McCracken,  
S. Hepburn and P. A. Heasman

School of Dental Sciences, University of  
Newcastle upon Tyne, Newcastle upon Tyne,  
UK

Heasman L, Stacey F, Preshaw PM, McCracken GI, Hepburn S, Heasman PA. The effect of smoking on periodontal treatment response: a review of clinical evidence. *J Clin Periodontol* 2006; 33: 241–253. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-051X.2006.00902.x.

### Abstract

**Background:** Smoking has been identified as a significant risk factor for periodontal diseases and is regarded as being responsible for incomplete or delayed healing in patients following treatment.

**Aim and Method:** The aim of this conventional review was to review, collate and tabulate the relative effectiveness of treatments of chronic periodontitis in smokers, non-smokers and ex-smokers.

**Observations:** The majority of clinical trials show significantly greater reductions in probing depths and bleeding on probing, and significantly greater gain of clinical attachment following non-surgical and surgical treatments in non-smokers compared with smokers. This benefit is also seen at class I and II furcation sites and in patients prescribed systemic or local antimicrobial treatments.

**Conclusions:** Data from epidemiological, cross-sectional and case-control studies strongly suggest that quitting smoking is beneficial to patients following periodontal treatments. The periodontal status of ex-smokers following treatment suggests that quitting the habit is beneficial although there are only limited data from long-term longitudinal clinical trials to demonstrate unequivocally the periodontal benefit of quitting smoking.

Key words: periodontitis; risk factors; smoking

Accepted for publication 6 January 2006

Smoking is undoubtedly one of the main, and most prevalent, risk factors for chronic periodontitis; risk calculations suggest that 40% of cases of chronic periodontitis may be attributable to smoking, with an increased odds ratio (OR) of 5.4 for chronic periodontitis in smokers (Brothwell 2001). Indeed, Haber has described a discrete, smoking-specific disease entity – smoking associated periodontitis – that is characterized by fibrotic gingiva, limited gingival redness and oedema relative to disease severity, proportionally greater pocketing in anterior and maxillary lingual sites, gingival recession at anterior sites and a lack of association between periodontal status and the level of oral hygiene (Haber 1994).

The majority of contemporary studies suggest that smoking increases the risk of periodontal diseases between two and six times. For example, Calsina in a case-control study of 240 private dental patients, showed that smokers had 2.7 times and former smokers 2.3 times greater probabilities to have established periodontal disease compared with non-smokers (Calsina et al. 2002). Linden found the OR for periodontal disease to be as high as 14.1 in young smokers (Linden & Mullally 1994) whereas Hyman examined data from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey III and reported an OR of 18.6 for  $\geq 3$  mm attachment loss among 20–49-year-old smokers compared with non-smokers. Among those over 50 years of age, the

OR increased to 25.6 for loss of attachment  $\geq 4$  mm (Hyman & Reid 2003).

More recently, Bergström (2003) suggested that smoking as an associated relative risk factor is dependent on the definition of disease and prevalence. For a broad definition of disease (1% pockets  $\geq 5$  mm) the OR was 3.0. When the definition of disease was narrow (15% pockets  $\geq 5$  mm) the OR was 12.1. Heavy exposure was associated with greater risk and for the combination of a narrower disease definition and heavy exposure the risk was defined by an OR of between 9.8 and 20.3.

Evidence of risk factor status is strengthened by the ability to demonstrate a dose-response, and ‘years of exposure’ to tobacco products is a

statistically significant risk factor for periodontal disease (Grossi et al. 1995, Martinez-Canut et al. 1995). It remains challenging, however, to determine the strength of smoking as a risk factor owing to inherent problems in measuring accurately a subject's exposure to tobacco (Scott et al. 2001, Molloy et al. 2004, Persson et al. 2005).

In general, therefore, there is a substantial body of evidence to support the observation that the more a patient smokes, the greater the degree of periodontal disease. The logical corollary then is that treatments for periodontal disease are likely to be more efficacious in non-smokers than in smokers, with the response of ex-smokers being intermediate between these two groups.

The principal objective of this paper is, therefore, to review the evidence for the relative clinical responses to periodontal treatment in smokers, non-smokers and ex-smokers.

### The Clinical Response of Smokers and Non-Smokers to Periodontal Treatment

A comprehensive review of the main outcome data from studies that have compared the effectiveness of treatment of periodontitis in smokers, non-smokers and ex-smokers is presented in Table 1.

Without exception, these are case-control, cross-sectional and parallel group studies primarily of smokers and non-smokers following different modalities of periodontal treatment. It must also be highlighted that the majority of the studies are relatively short-term in duration (less than 1 year follow-up), and it is therefore not possible to establish whether some of the clinically and significant differences seen between smokers and non-smokers in particular will be maintained in the longer term. It is also important to note that although non-smokers universally respond better to periodontal treatment than do smokers, there is nevertheless substantial evidence of clinical improvement in smokers after treatment, indicating that smoking as a risk factor will compromise rather than prevent tissue healing.

With non-surgical therapy as the main treatment modality, most authors report greater reductions in probing depth in non-smokers compared with smokers (Preber & Bergström 1985, Preber et al. 1995, Grossi et al. 1997, Renvert et al. 1998, Preshaw et al. 1999,

Jin et al. 2000). The magnitude of the differences in shorter term studies (1–3 months) tend to be of the magnitude of 0.1–0.3 mm and therefore of doubtful clinical significance (Preber & Bergström 1985, Preber et al. 1995, Grossi et al. 1997). Jin et al. (2000), however, reported significantly greater reductions of the order 1.0 mm in non-smokers compared with smokers at 1 and 3 months following non-surgical therapy. Further, Papantonopoulos (1999) noted that between 6 and 8 weeks following non-surgical therapy, significantly more smokers (42.8%) than non-smokers (11.5%) required further treatment and the smokers may have benefitted from a surgical approach in the first instance (Papantonopoulos 1999).

Not all studies, however, have shown unequivocally a more effective response in non-smokers compared with smokers. Pucher et al. (1997) reported that smokers and non-smokers responded similarly to non-surgical therapy after 9 months with reference to reduction in probing depth, attachment level gain and reduction in bleeding on probing. Only non-smokers, however, showed a significant improvement in gingival index after 9 months compared with baseline. Further, in their post-non-surgical treatment evaluation of 12 smokers and 14 non-smokers, Zuabi et al. (1999) reported no difference in post-treatment probing depth and clinical attachment level between smokers and non-smokers. There was, however, significantly more plaque in smokers compared with the non-smokers and the smokers had significantly greater probing depths at baseline compared with the non-smokers. Consequently, the greater probing depth reduction (0.81 mm) in smokers compared with non-smokers (0.5 mm) will itself have been a direct consequence of the greater depth of pocketing in smokers before treatment.

In general terms, there appears to be a sustained benefit in both probing depth, reduction and gain of attachment level in longer term studies (Kaldahl et al. 1996, Renvert et al. 1998, Preshaw et al. 1999, Bergström et al. 2000, Jin et al. 2000). The number of studies with more than 12 months follow-up, however, is both small and disappointing. In a radiographic study, Meinberg et al. (2001) reported significantly more bone loss after 12 months follow-up in smokers compared with non-smokers and concluded that more longer term studies are essential in order to identify the associa-

tion between smoking status and outcome variables (Meinberg et al. 2001).

Although the majority of clinical trials have recruited patients with chronic periodontitis, Darby et al. (2005) reported a significantly greater probing depth reduction in non-smokers with aggressive periodontitis (2.4 mm) compared with patients with aggressive periodontitis who smoke (1.3 mm). In each case, the magnitude of probing-depth resolution was greater than that seen in those patients with chronic periodontitis at 6 weeks post-scaling and root instrumentation (Darby et al. 2005).

The clinical benefit seen in non-smokers following non-surgical therapy has also been observed following surgical treatment (Preber & Bergström 1990), Modified Widman flap procedures (Ah et al. 1994), and surgical management of class I and II furcation defects (Trombelli et al. 2003). The most impressive report of clinical attachment gain in non-smokers (5.2 mm) compared with smokers (2.1 mm) was observed by Tonetti et al. (1995) who carried out guided tissue regeneration of infrabony defects using Gore-Tex<sup>®</sup> (Gore Medical Products, Newark, DE, USA) membranes and with a follow-up period of 1 year. They also concluded that higher plaque levels that are seen consistently in smokers compared with non-smokers will also have influenced the clinical outcomes (Tonetti et al. 1995).

A number of authors have also reported clinical outcomes in smokers and non-smokers following non-surgical treatment with, or without either systemic or locally delivered antimicrobial therapy (Kinane & Radvar 1997, Palmer et al. 1999, Ryder et al. 1999, Soder et al. 1999, Tomasi & Wennström 2004, Preshaw et al. 2005a). Again, smokers demonstrated clinical benefit post-treatment, both with respect to probing depth and attachment level outcomes, although the magnitude of improvement is consistently less than that seen in non-smokers. In a 9-month, placebo-controlled, randomized trial in which smokers and non-smokers were treated by scaling and root planing with and without sub-antimicrobial doxycycline (Periostat<sup>™</sup>, Collagenex Pharmaceuticals Inc., Newtown, PA, USA), Preshaw et al. (2005a) noted with respect to probing depth reduction and clinical attachment gain a hierarchical treatment response of the order non-smokers+doxycycline – smokers+doxycycline – non-smokers+placebo – smokers+placebo. They con-

Table 1. A review of studies that have compared the effectiveness of treatment of chronic periodontitis in smokers, non-smokers and ex-smokers

| Study                     | Treatment                                                            | Interval of follow-up               | Smokers                                                                                                                   | Non-smokers                                                                                                               | Ex-smokers | Conclusions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|---------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Preber & Bergström (1985) | Non-surgical therapy                                                 | 1 month                             | Mean PD reduction of 1.1 mm                                                                                               | Mean PD reduction of 1.2 mm                                                                                               |            | Non-surgical therapy can reduce PD in smokers and non-smokers. However, compared with non-smokers, smokers have less reduction of PD for the dentition as a whole                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Preber & Bergström (1986) | Non-surgical therapy                                                 | 1 month                             | Mean PI reduction 0.46<br>Mean BOP reduction 14.4%                                                                        | Mean PI reduction 0.24<br>Mean BOP reduction 26.8%                                                                        |            | Compared with non-smokers, the reduction in bleeding was less pronounced in smokers in spite of greater reduction of plaque index                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Preber & Bergström (1990) | Periodontal surgery                                                  | 1 year                              | Mean PD reduction of 0.76 mm                                                                                              | Mean PD reduction of 1.27 mm                                                                                              |            | The difference in PD reduction between smokers and non-smokers was statistically significant and independent of plaque after 12 months ( $p < 0.001$ ). Smoking may interfere with the therapeutic outcome following periodontal surgery either through interference with primary healing events or considered as evidence of recurring disease |
| Ah et al. (1994)          | Non-surgical therapy and modified Widman surgery                     | 4, 10 weeks, and yearly for 6 years | 0.5 mm less mean attachment gain and PD reduction; 0.6 mm greater attachment loss relative to non-smokers                 | Significantly greater recession in deeper ( $\geq 7$ mm) pockets                                                          |            | Sites in smokers do not respond as well to non-surgical or surgical therapy as those in non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Tonetti et al. (1995)     | Guided tissue regeneration (Gore-Tex®) of deep infra-bony pockets    | 1 year                              | 2.1 mm mean attachment gain                                                                                               | 5.2 mm mean attachment gain                                                                                               |            | Cigarette smoking is associated with a reduced healing response after GTR treatment although consistently higher plaque levels in smokers will also have influenced outcomes.                                                                                                                                                                   |
| Preber et al. (1995)      | Non-surgical therapy                                                 | 2 months                            | Mean PD reduction 0.9 mm<br>40% of diseased sites ( $>4$ mm) healed                                                       | Mean PD reduction 1.1 mm<br>57% of diseased sites ( $>4$ mm) healed                                                       |            | Smokers have a less favourable outcome to non-surgical therapy<br>There was almost total eradication of Actinobacillus actinomycetemcomitans and Porphyromonas gingivalis in smokers and non-smokers                                                                                                                                            |
| Rosen et al. (1996)       | Non-surgical therapy and infra-bony pockets treated with bone grafts | 1 year and 2-5 years                | At 1 year: 29.2% gain in attachment<br>reduction in PD<br>At 2-5 years: 31.3% gain in attachment<br>43.9% reduction in PD | At 1 year: 42.5% gain in attachment<br>reduction in PD<br>At 2-5 years: 41.8% gain in attachment<br>48.3% reduction in PD |            | Treated infra-bony defects are adversely affected in smokers compared with non-smokers.<br>Smoking adversely affects treatment outcomes                                                                                                                                                                                                         |

Table 1. (Contd.)

| Study                  | Treatment                                                                      | Interval of follow-up                 | Smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                              | Ex-smokers                                                                                                                                                                              | Conclusions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Kaldahl et al. (1996)  | Periodontal therapy followed by supportive periodontal treatment               | 4, 10 weeks; and yearly up to 7 years | Heavy and light smokers show similar changes of HALs at molar furcation sites relative to both ex- and non-smokers after active treatment<br>Heavy and light smokers experienced greater loss during 7 years of SPT<br>Heavy smokers had a higher percentage of plaque positive sites e.g. between 45% and 55% sites compared with between 15% and 35% for light smokers | Good response to therapy<br>Improvement in HALs. Approximately 0.5 mm more PD reduction at 1 year than smokers                                                                           | More PD reduction than non-smokers during SPT                                                                                                                                           | Both groups of smokers, heavy and light, responded less favourably to therapy and heavy smokers responded less well than light smokers. A history of smoking is not deleterious to the response to therapy                                                                                              |
| Kinane & Radvar (1997) | Non-surgical therapy with or without local antimicrobial periodontal therapies | 6 weeks                               | Mean PD reduction of 1.76 mm<br>Mean attachment loss of 0.50 mm<br>No decrease in GCF (0.41 pg/30 s) which remained lower than in non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Mean PD reduction of 1.14 mm<br>Mean attachment loss of 0.52 mm<br>Decrease in GCF (0.44 pg/30 s from 0.51 pg/30 s)                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                         | Smoking has an important role in determining the prognosis of periodontal treatment particularly in persistent and deeper pockets. More pronounced and significantly unfavourable response at initially deeper sites. Differences in clinical outcomes were unaffected by differences in plaque control |
| Pucher et al. (1997)   | Non-surgical therapy                                                           | 9 months                              | Mean reduction in PD of 0.65 mm<br>Increase in attachment 0.59 mm<br>BOP significantly decreased from baseline<br>No reduction in GI compared with baseline                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Mean reduction in PD of 0.6 mm maintained at 9 months<br>Attachment level gain 0.47 mm<br>BOP significantly decreased from baseline<br>GI decreased significantly compared with baseline |                                                                                                                                                                                         | Smokers and non-smokers responded similarly to treatment after 9 months                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Grossi et al. (1997)   | Non-surgical therapy                                                           | 3 months                              | Mean reduction in PI of 0.54<br>Mean reduction in BI of 0.23<br>Mean reduction in PD of 0.33 and 1.3 mm in pockets over 5 mm<br>Mean gain in attachment 0.32 and 1.3 mm in deep pockets                                                                                                                                                                                  | Mean reduction in PI of 0.41<br>Mean reduction in BI of 0.37<br>Mean reduction in PD of 0.49 and 1.8 mm in pockets over 5 mm<br>Mean gain in attachment 0.43 and 1.7 mm in deep pockets  | Mean reduction in PI of 0.69<br>Mean reduction in BI of 0.38<br>Mean reduction in PD of 0.49 and 1.7 mm in pockets over 5 mm<br>Mean gain in attachment 0.43 and 1.6 mm in deep pockets | Smoking impairs periodontal healing and as the healing and microbial response of ex-smokers is comparable with non-smokers; smoking cessation may restore the normal periodontal healing response                                                                                                       |

Table 1. (Contd.)

| Study                 | Treatment                                                                                                                                                                        | Interval of follow-up      | Smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Ex-smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Conclusions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Renvert et al. (1998) | Non-surgical therapy                                                                                                                                                             | 6 months                   | Individual mean % of <i>P. gingivalis</i> 1.8<br>Individual mean % of <i>B. forsythus</i> 1.9<br><br>Mean reduction in PD of 1.9 mm<br><br>Reduction in numbers of <i>P. gingivalis</i> - and <i>P. intermedia</i> -infected sites comparable in smokers and non-smokers with respect to baseline         | Individual mean % of <i>P. gingivalis</i> 0.7<br>Individual mean % of <i>B. forsythus</i> 1.0<br><i>P. gingivalis</i> eradicated in 75% of patients<br><br>Mean reduction in PD of 2.5 mm                                                                                                                 | Individual mean % of <i>P. gingivalis</i> 0.7<br>Individual mean % of <i>B. forsythus</i> 1.6<br><i>P. gingivalis</i> eradicated in 92% of patients                                                                                                                                                       | The microbial response conforms to the clinical response with little influence of the smoking habits                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| Soder et al. (1999)   | Non-surgical therapy with or without systemic metronidazole SRP undertaken every 6 months for 5 years<br>Surgical intervention if PDs increased > 2 mm between successive visits | Every 6 months for 5 years | After 5 years<br>Only a reduction in absolute number of sites > 5 mm<br>Reduction in A.a. <i>P. gingivalis</i> , <i>P. intermedia</i> and spirochaetes                                                                                                                                                    | After 5 years<br>Significant improvements in % of teeth with PDs > 5 mm, overall PDs, attachment level and bone height ( $p < 0.01$ )<br>Reduction in A.a. <i>P. gingivalis</i> , <i>P. intermedia</i> and spirochaetes                                                                                   | Non-surgical group<br>Attachment level gain of 1.00 mm (1.43 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.43 mm (2.06 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>Doxycycline group<br>Attachment level gain of 0.69 mm (0.12 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.12 mm (1.71 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm) | The intervention group of non-smokers taking metronidazole as an adjunct to non-surgical therapy showed a statistically significant improvement. Those who were healthy (complete healing deemed to be the absence of inflamed sites $\geq 5$ mm) after 5 years were the same patients considered healthy after 6 months. Decisive factors to sustained improvement in patients are probably: initial scaling and root planing; a brief course of metronidazole; and 6 monthly oral hygiene, scaling and root planing |
| Ryder et al. (1999)   | Non-surgical treatment or subgingival doxycycline                                                                                                                                | 9 months                   | Non-surgical group<br>Attachment level gain of 0.76 mm (0.96 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.02 mm (1.48 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>Doxycycline group<br>Attachment level gain of 0.83 mm (0.87 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.21 mm (1.49 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm) | Non-surgical group<br>Attachment level gain of 1.00 mm (1.43 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.43 mm (2.06 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>Doxycycline group<br>Attachment level gain of 0.69 mm (0.12 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.12 mm (1.71 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm) | Non-surgical group<br>Attachment level gain of 0.60 mm (0.90 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.05 mm (1.58 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>Doxycycline group<br>Attachment level gain of 0.88 mm (1.15 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm)<br>PD reduction of 1.33 mm (2.00 mm in pockets $\geq 7$ mm) | A significantly greater clinical attachment gain was found in the non-smoking non-surgical therapy group especially in the deeper pockets where there were greater improvements compared with smokers and ex-smokers. The two treatment modalities have both common and different effects on the elimination of pathogens and host and healing response. Because of these differences, local doxycycline and NST may act in synergy if used together in periodontal treatment                                         |

Table 1. (Contd.)

| Study                        | Treatment                                                                                                     | Interval of follow-up                                | Smokers                                                                                                                                                                 | Non-smokers                                                                                                                                                               | Ex-smokers                                                      | Conclusions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Zuabi <i>et al.</i> (1999)   | Non-surgical therapy                                                                                          | Post-treatment                                       | Mean PI reduction of 0.51<br>Mean PD reduction of 0.81<br>Mean attachment level gain of 0.58 mm<br>Calcium concentration 3.58 mg/100 ml<br>Albumin level 0.38 mg/100 ml | Mean PI reduction of 0.52<br>Mean PD reduction of 0.50 mm<br>Mean attachment level gain of 0.44 mm<br>Calcium concentration 5.11 mg/100 ml<br>Albumin level 1.1 mg/100 ml |                                                                 | Post-treatment PD and attachment levels were similar in smokers and non-smokers due to the fact that smokers had greater PD reduction from the baseline scores. Smokers exhibited greater disease levels but reduced sodium, calcium and magnesium concentrations. The smokers responded favourably to treatment and the clinical improvement eliminated the differences in salivary composition                                                                                                                  |
| Preshaw <i>et al.</i> (1999) | Non-surgical therapy                                                                                          | 6 months after a 6 month treatment phase (13 months) | At month 6<br>Mean PD 5.92 mm<br>At month 13<br>Mean PD 4.46 mm                                                                                                         | At month 6<br>Mean PD 5.30 mm<br>At month 13<br>Mean PD 4.14 mm                                                                                                           | At month 6<br>Mean PD 5.30 mm<br>At month 13<br>Mean PD 3.68 mm | PDs were reduced following treatment in all groups even though smokers had deeper PD than non- and ex-smokers. Disease progression was not identified over a 6-month period. Significant improvements were observed after scaling and root planing and bone loss was halted or reversed. Regular and frequent maintenance visits are important following treatment<br>Smokers, non-smokers and ex-smokers did not differ significantly in plaque, BOP, attachment levels, radiographic, or biochemical parameters |
| Palmer <i>et al.</i> (1999)  | Non-surgical therapy with or without systemic or local metronidazole (Elyzol® Dumex Ltd, Copenhagen, Denmark) | 6 months                                             | Reduction in PD of 1.23 mm<br>Reduction in spirochaetes 35.8%                                                                                                           | Reduction in PD 1.92 mm<br>Reduction in spirochaetes 46.7%                                                                                                                |                                                                 | Smokers have a poorer treatment response to scaling and root planing regardless of the application of either systemic or locally applied adjunctive metronidazole<br>No significant differences between smokers and non-smokers for attachment loss or any clinical response to the treatment regimes                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Papantonopoulos (1999)       | Non-surgical therapy                                                                                          | 6–12 weeks                                           | 42.8% of smokers needed further treatment of 16% of their teeth                                                                                                         | 11.5% of non-smokers needed further treatment of 16% of their teeth                                                                                                       |                                                                 | For smokers with at least one of five sites $\geq 6$ mm, surgery should be initiated rather than treating first with non-surgical therapy. Smoking impairs healing after non-surgical periodontal therapy<br>Further treatment needs were particularly high in upper and lower pre-molar areas                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

Table 1. (Contd.)

| Study                   | Treatment                                             | Interval of follow-up                      | Smokers                                                                                                                                                                                   | Non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                               | Ex-smokers                                                                                                           | Conclusions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Jin et al. (2000)       | Non-surgical therapy                                  | 1, 3 and up to 6 months                    | At 1, 3 and 6 months there were mean PD reductions of 1.1, 1.1 and 1.6 mm, respectively. At 1, 3 and 6 months there were mean attachment level gains of 0.1, 0.3 and 0.5 mm, respectively | At 1, 3 and 6 months there were mean PD reductions of 1.9, 2.4 and 2.5 mm, respectively. At 1, 3 and 6 months there were mean attachment level gains of 0.5, 0.8 and 1.2 mm, respectively |                                                                                                                      | Significant reductions in PD in non-smokers compared with smokers at all time points<br>Significant attachment level gains in non-smokers only seen at 6 months. Smokers have different treatment response patterns and healing dynamics following non-surgical therapy suggesting the importance of a more intensive treatment regime                                                                                    |
| Bergström et al. (2000) | Non-surgical therapy                                  | 10 years                                   | Frequency of diseased sites (PD > 4 mm) increased from 18.7% to 41.6%. Mean % bone height reduction from 80.3% to 76.5%                                                                   | Frequency of diseased sites (PD > 4 mm) decreased from 8.7–6.6%. Mean % bone height reduction from 85.1–84.1%                                                                             | Frequency of diseased sites (PD > 4 mm) decreased from 11.1% to 7.8%. Mean bone height reduction from 80.7% to 79.6% | The 10-year change increased significantly with increasing smoking exposure controlling for age<br>Periodontal health remained unaltered throughout the 10 years for non-smokers suggesting that smoking cessation is beneficial to periodontal health. As the plaque index remained at similarly low levels in all groups it was concluded that the only harmful impact on periodontal health to be detected was smoking |
| Meinberg et al. (2001)  | Non-surgical therapy                                  | 1 year                                     | Mean bone loss 5.75 mm; smokers had consistently higher percentages of moderate and severe pockets than did non-smokers                                                                   | Mean bone loss of 4.64 mm                                                                                                                                                                 | Mean bone loss of 4.89 mm                                                                                            | The impact of smoking may require longer than 1 year to show longitudinal changes. It is recommended that radiographic analysis is carried out periodically during non-surgical therapy and that longer term studies should be conducted to identify the outcome of smoking status on this variable                                                                                                                       |
| Trombelli et al. (2003) | Flap surgery at furcation defects                     | 6 months                                   | 27.6% of class II furcations showed improvement<br>After 6 months 3.4% of pre-surgery class I furcation defects showed complete closure                                                   | 38.5% of class II furcations showed improvement<br>After 6 months 27.8% of pre-surgery class I furcation defects showed complete closure                                                  |                                                                                                                      | Flap surgery produced clinically and statistically significant PD reduction and clinical attachment gain in class I/II molar furcation defects<br>Smokers exhibit a less favourable healing outcome following surgery in terms of vertical and horizontal attachment gain                                                                                                                                                 |
| Papantonopoulos (2004)  | Non-surgical therapy and surgical therapy as required | 3–4 times a year for between 5 and 8 years | 11 sites in six smokers exhibited radiographic bone loss $\geq 2$ mm over 5–8 years<br>Two smokers lost three teeth                                                                       | Seven sites in four non-smokers exhibited radiographic bone loss $\geq 2$ mm over 5–8 years<br>One non-smoker lost One tooth                                                              |                                                                                                                      | Patients treated for advanced periodontal disease and well maintained over 5–8 years showed no statistically significant differences between smokers and non-smokers in clinical probing depths and radiographic bone-loss measurements<br>Smoking increased the OD $10.7 \times$ of having $\geq 1$ site with bone loss $\geq 2$ mm                                                                                      |

Table 1. (Contd.)

| Study                      | Treatment                                                                                                                                                  | Interval of follow-up | Smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Non-smokers                                              | Ex-smokers | Conclusions                                                                            |
|----------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Tomasi & Wennström (2004)  | Non-surgical ultrasonic treatment with locally delivered doxycycline gel 8.5%w/w Atridox <sup>TM</sup> (Collagenex Pharmaceuticals Inc., Newtown, PA, USA) | 3 months              | Mean PD reduction of 1.35 mm<br>Mean CAL gain of 0.84 mm                                                                                                                                                               | Mean PD reduction of 1.62 mm<br>Mean CAL gain of 0.90 mm |            | Smoking negatively influences treatment outcomes in terms of PD reduction and CAL gain |
| Stavropoulos et al. (2004) | Surgical treatment of vertical defects with bioresorbable membranes                                                                                        | 12 months             | Mean PD reduction of 4.5 mm<br>Mean CAL gain of 3.2 mm                                                                                                                                                                 | Mean PD reduction of 5.5 mm<br>Mean CAL gain of 4.3 mm   |            | Smoking impairs healing of GTR-treated infrabony defects                               |
| Preshaw et al. (2005a)     | Subantimicrobial systemic doxycycline (Periostat <sup>®</sup> as an adjunct to scaling and root planing in a placebo-controlled trial                      | 9 months              | A hierarchical treatment response with non-smokers on doxycycline showing the greatest CAL gain and reduction in PD. In general, smokers on doxycycline performed approximately the same as the non-smokers on placebo |                                                          |            |                                                                                        |

PD, probing depth; PI, plaque index; BOP, bleeding on probing; HAL, horizontal attachment level; REC, gingival recession; SPT, supportive periodontal therapy; GCF, gingival crevicular fluid; GI, gingival index; CAL, clinical attachment level; *P. gingivalis*, *Porphyromonas gingivalis*; *B. forsythus*, *Bacillus forsythus*.

cluded that adjunctive sub-antimicrobial dose doxycycline-enhanced therapeutic outcomes in all groups with smokers taking doxycycline showing approximately the same magnitude of clinical improvement as non-smokers on placebo.

### Longitudinal Evidence for the Benefits of Smoking Cessation on the Periodontium

The majority of studies investigating the effects of smoking cessation on periodontal disease acknowledge the benefits of giving patients smoking cessation advice and that smoking cessation may result in a long-term benefit to the periodontal condition (Ramseier 2005). Further, the implementation of population-based smoking cessation programmes may also have a significant impact on the prevalence and progression of periodontal diseases (Susin et al. 2004). The evidence to confirm unequivocally and scientifically the benefit of quitting smoking on patients with periodontal disease is, however, sparse and several authors have expressed concern for this lack of evidence (AAP 1996, Qandil et al. 1997, Meinberg et al. 2001, Scott et al. 2001).

Limited evidence is available, however. Bolin et al. (1993) reported results from a 10-year radiographic follow-up study of alveolar bone loss which found that the progression of bone loss was significantly retarded in those who had quit smoking during the study compared with continual smokers.

In the only longitudinal study to date, our group has reported 12-month data from 10 subjects with periodontitis who had continuously quit smoking for the entire study period. The quitters demonstrated a significant reduction in probing depths compared with non-quitters as well as a higher incidence of probing depth reductions of  $\geq 2$  and  $\geq 3$  mm (Preshaw et al. 2005b).

### Immune-Inflammatory Mechanisms Underlying the Clinical Response

The evidence reviewed in the previous sections suggests clearly that the periodontal treatment response in non-smokers is significantly better than the response seen in smokers irrespective of the nature or modality of the treatment undertaken. There is insuffi-

Table 2. The effects of smoking on the bacterial challenge, the host periodontal tissues and the immune-inflammatory response. The potential effect of quitting smoking is hypothesized

| Author, year                                                                                                | Effect of smoking and nicotine on the host periodontal tissues and the immune inflammatory response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | The potential effect of quitting smoking                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Alavi et al. (1995)                                                                                         | Smoking reduces the absolute amount of GCF elastase in patients with established and untreated chronic periodontitis suggesting a compromised neutrophil response                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | More effective phagocytosis and digestion by neutrophils                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Persson et al. (1999)                                                                                       | This observation was not seen in healthy individuals                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| Soder et al. (2002)                                                                                         | There is an increase in the release of neutrophil functional elastase and elastase complexed to $\alpha$ -1 antitrypsin in smokers with chronic periodontitis. Nicotine has a depressive effect on neutrophil function and enhances degranulation, as the cells are more sensitive to bacterial challenge                                                                              | Restoration of neutrophil function to provide a more effective response to the bacterial challenge                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| Böstrom et al. (1998), Böstrom et al. (1999), Fredriksson (2002)                                            | Increased concentrations of TNF- $\alpha$ in GCF of smokers owing to exposure of macrophages to nicotine<br><br>In vitro studies suggest that peripheral neutrophils of smokers tend to release more TNF- $\alpha$ than those of non-smokers                                                                                                                                           | Damping of TNF- $\alpha$ release may contribute to a reduction in connective tissue (including bone) destruction and periodontal stability<br>The increase in TNF- $\alpha$ is also seen in ex-smokers, which suggests that smoking may have a long-lasting effect of neutrophil response                                                                                      |
| Kazor et al. (1999), Zambon et al. (1996)                                                                   | Smoking appears to select for specific periodontopathogens ( <i>P. gingivalis</i> ; <i>T. denticola</i> ; <i>B. forsythus</i> ) thus increasing the risk of the development and progression of periodontal disease                                                                                                                                                                     | A shift towards a less pathogenic subgingival flora although the BANA-positive pathogens are equally prevalent in ex-smokers as in smokers. 68% of plaques removed from never smokers also contain BANA-positive organisms (Kazor et al. 1999)                                                                                                                                 |
| Loesche (1994), Bergstrom & Bostrom (2001), Chen et al. (2001), Nair et al. (2003), Morozumi et al. (2004a) | Smoking leads to sustained peripheral vasoconstriction caused by chronic low doses of nicotine. This leads to reduced gingival bleeding. This effect can 'mask' the presence of periodontal disease. The compromised gingival microvasculature could also lead to reduced oxygen tension that would allow periodontal anaerobes to prevail (Loesche 1994)                              | An increase in oxygen tension may help towards a shift towards a less pathogenic subgingival flora<br>Gingival microcirculation could recover in the early stages of smoking cessation, which could activate gingival tissue metabolism and local host immune responses                                                                                                        |
| Mavropoulos et al. (2003)                                                                                   | There is some evidence to suggest that, in smokers, gingival blood flow may actually increase owing to hyperaemia and the increase in blood pressure although, in the long term, the effect of vasoconstriction overcomes this more acute effect (Mavropoulos et al. 2003)                                                                                                             | Gingival blood and crevicular fluid flow increase within only a few days after quitting smoking (Morozumi et al. 2004a) and the prevalence of bleeding on probing in patients with chronic periodontitis increases, despite an improvement in the level of plaque control (Nair et al. 2003)                                                                                   |
| Haffajee & Socransky (2001)                                                                                 | Greater prevalence of orange and red complexes in smokers than in ex-smokers and never smokers: <i>E. nodatum</i> ; <i>F. nucleatum ss vincentii</i> ; <i>P. intermedia</i> ; <i>P. micros</i> ; <i>P. nigrescens</i> ; <i>B. forsythus</i> ; <i>P. gingivalis</i> ; <i>T. denticola</i> . This observation was seen in deep (>4 mm) and shallow (<4 mm) pockets                       | A shift towards a less pathogenic subgingival flora possibly by changing the anaerobic conditions of the subgingival environment at all pocket depths                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Cuff et al. (1989)Giannopoulou et al. (1999), James et al. (1999) Gamal & Bayomy (2002)                     | Nicotine inhibits the proliferation, chemotaxis and attachment of periodontal ligament fibroblasts in vitro<br>There is also structural alteration of the cells that prevent them from adhering to flat and root-planed surfaces<br>These effects are likely to be enhanced by nicotine on root surfaces (Cuff et al. 1989) and this may affect periodontal regeneration after therapy | Enhanced fibroblast adhesion to the root surface after root surface instrumentation leading to better integrity of the healing periodontal tissues<br>One aim of root surface instrumentation may be to remove nicotine deposits that may prevent a healing response. Such deposits are likely to reform in smokers who persist with the habit following periodontal treatment |

Table 2. (Contd.)

| Author, year                                                                                         | Effect of smoking and nicotine on the host periodontal tissues and the immune inflammatory response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | The potential effect of quitting smoking                                                                                                                                                                              |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Lie et al. (2001)                                                                                    | Smoking reduces salivary cystatin activity and cystatin C levels during experimental gingivitis. This observation does not appear to be related to flow rate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Increased output of glandular cystatins and cystatin activity will contribute towards host protection against inflammation by inhibiting certain proteolytic enzymes such as cysteine proteinases                     |
| Loos et al. (2004)                                                                                   | Smoking leads to greater periodontal breakdown associated with increased numbers of CD3+ T cells as well as CD4+ and CD8+ T cell subsets. There was no apparent effect on the numbers of B cells                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Damping down of the enhanced T cell response                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Rawlinson et al. (2003)                                                                              | GCF IL-1 $\beta$ levels are reduced in GCF at deep sites—both bleeding and non-bleeding. This may be owing to reduced production or possibly to increased receptor binding of the molecules that would lead to greater activity of IL-1 $\beta$                                                                                                                                                                                          | Restoration of the immuno-inflammatory response will lead to greater concentrations of IL-1 $\beta$ in GCF. This may represent an enhanced immune response or a reduction in bound IL-1 $\beta$                       |
| Bergström (2004)                                                                                     | 10 years bone height reduction was $\times 2.7$ greater in smokers than in non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Jansson & Lavstedt (2002), Jansson et al. (2002)<br>Paulander et al. (2004)<br>Baljoon et al. (2004) | Smoking was significantly correlated to an increased marginal bone loss over 20 years and found to be a significant risk factor in marginal bone loss<br>Relative risk of continued alveolar bone loss 3.6 for smokers compared with non-smokers<br>Prevalence and severity of vertical bone defects significantly associated with smoking<br>Relative risk of vertical bone loss associated with smoking is increased two to three fold | Smoking cessation results in a return towards the rate of bone loss seen in non-smokers<br>Subjects who quit smoking (ex-smokers) have reduced risk for bone loss compared with never smokers (Paulander et al. 2004) |
| Morozumi et al. (2004b)                                                                              | Transcript levels (mRNA) of peripheral neutrophils in smokers are generally lower than those in non-smokers – possibly associated with an impairment of neutrophil function                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Smoking cessation in 11 subjects for 8 weeks showed a significant recovery of matrix metalloproteinase-8 RNA; a sign of recovery of neutrophil metabolism and viability                                               |
| Kamma et al. (2004)                                                                                  | GCF IL-1 $\beta$ shows a positive association with smoking but only in periodontally healthy subjects. This is possibly owing to already maximal stimulation of monocytes having occurred in subjects with periodontitis                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Restoration of the local imbalance in cytokine production                                                                                                                                                             |
| Petropoulos et al. (2004)                                                                            | A number of complex mechanisms including IL-1 genotype likely influences marked reduction of GCF IL-1 $\alpha$ production                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Restoration of the local imbalance in cytokine production                                                                                                                                                             |
| Natto et al. (2005)                                                                                  | In a Saudi Arabian population, the prevalence of bone loss in excess of 30% original bone height was 24% in smokers compared with 6% in non-smokers                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Reduction of the rate of alveolar bone resorption                                                                                                                                                                     |

cient evidence currently available, however, to determine unequivocally the precise mechanisms by which quitting smoking moderates or influences the host response to the treatment. Indeed, the potential benefit of smoking cessation is likely to be mediated through a number of different pathways

that may include a shift towards a less pathogenic subgingival flora, recovery of the gingival microcirculation, restoration of neutrophil function, metabolism and viability, damping of the enhanced immune response and re-establishing any imbalance in the local or systemic production of cytokines.

A brief, contemporary overview of the effects of smoking, nicotine and its metabolites on the subgingival microflora, the periodontal tissues and the host response is presented in Table 2 so that the potential mechanisms that may underpin the potential benefits of quitting smoking can be hypothesized.

## Conclusions

A long-term, longitudinal clinical trial that monitors over several years the response to treatment in a cohort of smokers with chronic periodontitis who quit the habit will provide a formidable challenge, particularly as continuous quit rates over extended periods are likely to erode the sample size, and therefore, power of a study. Such a study will inevitably be lengthy and expensive, and would need to enrol multiple centres to ensure an adequate sample size, and more clinically and significantly meaningful data; a view confirmed by Palmer (2005) in a recent Guest Editorial in this Journal. Until such a study is undertaken, the dental profession can reflect on the strong evidence base of the epidemiological, cross-sectional and case-control studies that are presented in the tables of this review to conclude that quitting smoking is likely to be beneficial to oral, and in particular, periodontal health. It is also reassuring to reflect on the theoretical modelling of the cost-effectiveness of smoking cessation described originally by Sintonen & Tuominen (1989). This model was reviewed again recently by Braegger (2005) in a position paper on cost-benefit of smoking cessation with the conclusion that adding smoking cessation to the concept of periodontitis prevention will enable significant cost savings to be made.

## References

- AAP (1996) Tobacco use and the periodontal patient. *Journal of Periodontology* **67**, 51–56.
- Ah, M. K., Johnson, G. K., Kaldahl, W. B., Patil, K. B. & Kalkwarf, K. L. (1994) The effect of smoking on the response to periodontal therapy. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **21**, 91–97.
- Alavi, A. L., Palmer, R. M., Odell, E. W., Coward, P. Y. & Wilson, R. F. (1995) Elastase in gingival crevicular fluid from smokers and non-smokers with chronic inflammatory periodontal disease. *Oral Diseases* **1**, 110–114.
- Baljoon, M., Natto, S. & Bergström, J. (2004) The association of smoking with vertical periodontal bone loss. *Journal of Periodontology* **75**, 844–851.
- Bergström, J. (2003) Tobacco smoking and risk for periodontal disease. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **30**, 107–113.
- Bergström, J. (2004) Influence of tobacco smoking on periodontal bone height. Long-term observations and a hypothesis. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 260–266.
- Bergström, J. & Boström, L. (2001) Tobacco smoking and periodontal hemorrhagic responsiveness. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **28**, 680–685.
- Bergström, J., Eliasson, S. & Dock, J. (2000) A 10-year prospective study of tobacco smoking and periodontal health. *Journal of Periodontology* **71**, 1338–1347.
- Bolin, A., Eklund, G., Frithiof, L. & Lavstedt, S. (1993) The effect of changed smoking habits on marginal alveolar bone loss. A longitudinal study. *Swedish Dental Journal* **17**, 211–216.
- Boström, L., Linder, L. E. & Bergström, J. (1998) Clinical expression of TNF-alpha in smoking-associated periodontal disease. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **25**, 767–773.
- Boström, L., Linder, L. E. & Bergström, J. (1999) Smoking and crevicular fluid levels of IL-6 and TNF-alpha in periodontal disease. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **26**, 352–357.
- Braegger, U. (2005) Cost-benefit, cost-effectiveness and cost-utility analyses of periodontitis prevention. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32** (Suppl. 6), 301–313.
- Brothwell, D. J. (2001) Should the use of smoking cessation products be promoted by dental offices? An evidence-based report. *Journal of the Canadian Dental Association* **67**, 149–155.
- Calsina, G., Ramon, J. M. & Echeverria, J. J. (2002) Effects of smoking on periodontal tissues. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **29**, 771–776.
- Chen, X., Wolff, L., Aeppli, D., Guo, Z., Luan, W., Baelum, V. & Fejeskov, O. (2001) Cigarette smoking, salivary/gingival crevicular fluid cotinine and periodontal status. A 10-year longitudinal study. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **28**, 331–339.
- Cuff, M. J., McQuade, M. J., Scheidt, M. J., Sutherland, D. E. & Van Dyke, T. E. (1989) The presence of nicotine on root surfaces of periodontally diseased teeth in smokers. *Journal of Periodontology* **60**, 564–569.
- Darby, I. B., Hodge, P. J., Riggio, M. P. & Kinane, D. F. (2005) Clinical and microbiological effect of scaling and root planing in smoker and non-smoker chronic and aggressive periodontitis patients. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 200–206.
- Fredriksson, M., Bergström, K. & Asman, B. (2002) IL-8 and TNF-alpha from peripheral neutrophils and acute-phase proteins in periodontitis. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **29**, 123–128.
- Gamal, A. Y. & Bayomy, M. M. (2002) Effect of cigarette smoking on human PDL fibroblasts attachment to periodontally involved root surfaces in vitro. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **29**, 763–770.
- Giannopoulou, C., Geinoz, A. & Cimasoni, G. (1999) Effects of nicotine on periodontal ligament fibroblasts in vitro. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **26**, 49–55.
- Grossi, S. G., Genco, R. J., Machtei, E. E., Ho, A. W., Koch, G., Dunford, R., Zambon, J. J. & Hausmann, E. (1995) Assessment of risk for periodontal disease. II. Risk indicators for alveolar bone loss. *Journal of Periodontology* **66**, 23–29.
- Grossi, S. G., Zambon, J., Machtei, E. E., Schifferle, R., Andreana, S., Genco, R. J., Cummins, D. & Harrap, G. (1997) Effects of smoking and smoking cessation on healing after mechanical periodontal therapy. *Journal of the American Dental Association* **128**, 599–607.
- Haber, J. (1994) Smoking is a major risk factor for periodontitis. *Current Opinion in Periodontology* **2**, 12–18.
- Haffajee, A. D. & Socransky, S. S. (2001) Relationship of cigarette smoking to attachment level profiles. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **28**, 283–295.
- Hyman, J. J. & Reid, B. C. (2003) Epidemiologic risk factors for periodontal attachment loss among adults in the United States. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **30**, 230–237.
- James, J. A., Sayers, N. M., Drucker, D. B. & Hull, P. S. (1999) Effects of tobacco products on the attachment and growth of periodontal ligament fibroblasts. *Journal of Periodontology* **70**, 518–525.
- Jansson, L. & Lavstedt, S. (2002) Influence of smoking on marginal bone loss and tooth loss – a prospective study over 20 years. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **29**, 750–756.
- Jansson, L., Lavstedt, S. & Zimmerman, M. (2002) Prediction of marginal bone loss and tooth loss – a prospective study over 20 years. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **29**, 672–678.
- Jin, L., Wong, K. Y., Leung, W. K. & Corbet, E. F. (2000) Comparison of treatment response patterns following scaling and root planing in smokers and non-smokers with untreated adult periodontitis. *Journal of Clinical Dentistry* **11**, 35–41.
- Kaldahl, W. B., Johnson, G. K., Patil, K. D. & Kalkwarf, K. L. (1996) Levels of cigarette consumption and response to periodontal therapy. *Journal of Periodontology* **67**, 675–681.
- Kamma, J. J., Giannopoulou, C., Vasdekis, V. G. & Mombelli, A. (2004) Cytokine profile in gingival crevicular fluid of aggressive periodontitis: influence of smoking and stress. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 894–902.
- Kazor, C., Taylor, G. W. & Loesche, W. J. (1999) The prevalence of BANA-hydrolyzing periodontopathic bacteria in smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **26**, 814–821.
- Kinane, D. F. & Radvar, M. (1997) The effect of smoking on mechanical and antimicrobial periodontal therapy. *Journal of Periodontology* **68**, 467–472.
- Lie, M. A., Loos, B. G., Henskens, Y. M., Timmerman, M. F., Veerman, E. C., van der Velden, U. & van der Weijden, G. A. (2001) Salivary cystatin activity and cystatin C in natural and experimental gingivitis in

- smokers and non-smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **28**, 979–984.
- Linden, G. J. & Mullally, B. H. (1994) Cigarette smoking and periodontal destruction in young adults. *Journal of Periodontology* **65**, 718–723.
- Loesche, W. J. (1994) Periodontal disease as a risk factor for heart disease. *Compendium* **15**, 976–991.
- Loos, B. G., Roos, M. T., Schellekens, P. T., van der Velden, U. & Miedema, F. (2004) Lymphocyte numbers and function in relation to periodontitis and smoking. *Journal of Periodontology* **75**, 557–564.
- Martinez-Canut, P., Lorca, A. & Magan, R. (1995) Smoking and periodontal disease severity. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **22**, 743–749.
- Mavropoulos, A., Aars, H. & Brodin, P. (2003) Hyperaemic response to cigarette smoking in healthy gingiva. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **30**, 214–221.
- Meinberg, T. A., Canarsky-Handley, A. M., McClenahan, A. K., Poulsen, D. D., Marx, D. B. & Reinhardt, R. A. (2001) Outcomes associated with supportive periodontal therapy in smokers and nonsmokers. *Journal of Dental Hygiene* **75**, 15–19.
- Molloy, J., Wolff, L. F., Lopez-Guzman, A. & Hodges, J. S. (2004) The association of periodontal disease parameters with systemic medical conditions and tobacco use. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 625–632.
- Morozumi, T., Kubota, T., Sato, T., Okuda, K. & Yoshie, H. (2004a) Smoking cessation increases gingival blood flow and gingival crevicular fluid. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 267–272.
- Morozumi, T., Kubota, T., Sugita, N., Itagaki, M. & Yoshie, H. (2004b) Alterations of gene expression in human neutrophils induced by smoking cessation. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 1110–1116.
- Nair, P., Sutherland, G., Palmer, R. M., Wilson, R. F. & Scott, D. A. (2003) Gingival bleeding on probing increases after quitting smoking. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **30**, 435–437.
- Natto, S., Baljoon, M. & Bergstrom, J. (2005) Tobacco smoking and periodontal bone height in a Saudi Arabian population. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 1000–1006.
- Palmer, R. M., Matthews, J. P. & Wilson, R. F. (1999) Non-surgical periodontal treatment with and without adjunctive metronidazole in smokers and non-smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **26**, 158–163.
- Palmer, R. M. (2005) Should quit smoking interventions be the first part of initial periodontal therapy. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 867–868.
- Papantonopoulos, G. H. (1999) Smoking influences decision making in periodontal therapy: a retrospective clinical study. *Journal of Periodontology* **70**, 1166–1173.
- Papantonopoulos, G. H. (2004) Effect of periodontal therapy in smokers and non-smokers with advanced periodontal disease: results after maintenance therapy for a minimum of 5 years. *Journal of Periodontology* **75**, 839–843.
- Paulander, J., Wennström, J. L., Axelsson, P. & Lindhe, J. (2004) Some risk factors for periodontal bone loss in 50-year-old individuals. A 10-year cohort study. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 489–496.
- Persson, L., Bergström, J., Gustafsson, A. & Åsman, B. (1999) Tobacco smoking and gingival neutrophil activity in young adults. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **26**, 9–13.
- Persson, R. E., Kiyak, A. H., Wyatt, C. C., Macentee, M. & Persson, G. R. (2005) Smoking, a weak predictor of periodontitis in older adults. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 512–517.
- Petropoulos, G., McKay, I. J. & Hughes, F. J. (2004) The association between neutrophil numbers and interleukin-1 $\alpha$  concentrations in gingival crevicular fluid of smokers and non-smokers with periodontal disease. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 390–395.
- Preber, H. & Bergström, J. (1985) The effect of non-surgical treatment on periodontal pockets in smokers and non-smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **13**, 319–323.
- Preber, H. & Bergström, J. (1986) Effect of non-surgical treatment on gingival bleeding in smokers and non-smokers. *Acta Odontologica Scandinavica* **44**, 85–89.
- Preber, H. & Bergström, J. (1990) Effect of cigarette smoking on periodontal healing following surgical therapy. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **17**, 324–328.
- Preber, H., Linder, L. & Bergström, J. (1995) Periodontal healing and periopathogenic microflora in smokers and non-smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **22**, 946–952.
- Preshaw, P. M., Lauffart, B., Zak, E., Jeffcoat, M. K., Barton, I. & Heasman, P. A. (1999) Progression and treatment of chronic adult periodontitis. *Journal of Periodontology* **70**, 1209–1220.
- Preshaw, P. M., Hefti, A. F. & Bradshaw, M. H. (2005a) Adjunctive subantimicrobial dose doxycycline in smokers and non-smokers with chronic periodontitis. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 610–616.
- Preshaw, P. M., Heasman, L., Stacey, F., Steen, N., McCracken, G. I. & Heasman, P. A. (2005b) The effect of quitting smoking on chronic periodontitis. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 869–879.
- Pucher, J. J., Shibley, O., Dentino, A. R. & Ciancio, S. G. (1997) Results of limited initial periodontal therapy in smokers and non-smokers. *Journal of Periodontology* **68**, 851–856.
- Qandil, R., Sandhu, H. S. & Matthews, D. C. (1997) Tobacco smoking and periodontal diseases. *Journal of the Canadian Dental Association* **63**, 187–195.
- Ramseier, C. A. (2005) Potential impact of subject-based risk factor control on periodontitis. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **32**, 283–290.
- Rawlinson, A., Grummitt, J. M., Walsh, T. F. & Ian Douglas, C. W. (2003) Interleukin 1 and receptor antagonist levels in gingival crevicular fluid in heavy smokers versus non-smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **30**, 42–48.
- Renvert, S., Dahlen, G. & Wikstrom, M. (1998) The clinical and microbiological effects of non-surgical periodontal therapy in smokers and non-smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **25**, 153–157.
- Rosen, P. S., Marks, M. H. & Reynolds, M. A. (1996) Influence of smoking on long-term clinical results of intrabony defects treated with regenerative therapy. *Journal of Periodontology* **67**, 1159–1163.
- Ryder, M. I., Pons, B., Adams, D., Beiswanger, B., Blanco, V., Bogle, G., Donly, K., Hallmon, W., Hancock, E. B., Hanes, P., Hawley, C., Johnson, L., Wang, H. L., Wolinsky, L., Yukna, R., Polson, A., Carron, G. & Garrett, S. (1999) Effects of smoking on local delivery of controlled-release doxycycline as compared to scaling and root planing. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **26**, 683–691.
- Scott, D. A., Palmer, R. M. & Stapleton, J. A. (2001) Validation of smoking status in clinical research into inflammatory periodontal disease. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **28**, 715–722.
- Sintonen, H. & Tuominen, R. (1989) Exploring the determinants of periodontal treatment costs: a special focus on cigarette smoking. *Social Science and Medicine* **29**, 835–844.
- Soder, B., Jin, L. J. & Wickholm, S. (2002) Granulocyte elastase, matrix metalloproteinase-8 and prostaglandin E2 in gingival crevicular fluid in matched clinical sites in smokers and non-smokers with persistent periodontitis. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **29**, 384–391.
- Soder, B., Nedlich, U. & Jin, L. J. (1999) Longitudinal effect of non-surgical treatment and systemic metronidazole for 1 week in smokers and non-smokers with refractory periodontitis: a 5-year study. *Journal of Periodontology* **70**, 761–771.
- Stavropoulos, A., Mardas, N., Herrero, F. & Karring, T. (2004) Smoking affects the outcome of guided tissue regeneration with bioresorbable membranes: a retrospective analysis of intrabony defects. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 945–950.
- Susin, C., Oppermann, R. V., Haugejorden, O. & Albander, J. M. (2004) Periodontal attachment loss attributable to cigarette smoking in an urban Brazilian population. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 951–958.
- Tomasi, C. & Wennstrom, J. L. (2004) Locally delivered doxycycline improves the healing following non-surgical periodontal therapy in smokers. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **31**, 589–595.
- Tonetti, M. S., Pini Prato, G. & Cortellini, P. (1995) Effect of cigarette smoking on periodontal healing following GTR in infrabony defects. A preliminary retrospective study.

- Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **22**, 229–234.
- Trombelli, L., Cho, K. S., Kim, C. K., Scapoli, C. & Scabbia, A. (2003) Impaired healing response of periodontal furcation defects following flap debridement surgery in smokers. A controlled clinical trial. *Journal of Clinical Periodontology* **30**, 81–87.
- Zambon, J. J., Grossi, S. G., Machtei, E. E., Ho, A. W., Dunford, R. & Genco, R. J. (1996) Cigarette smoking increases the risk for subgingival infection with periodontal pathogens. *Journal of Periodontology* **67**, 1050–1054.
- Zuabi, O., Machtei, E. E., Ben-Aryeh, H., Ardekian, L., Peled, M. & Laufer, D. (1999) The effect of smoking and periodontal treatment on salivary composition in patients with established periodontitis. *Journal of Periodontology* **70**, 1240–1246.
- Supported by a grant from Philips Oral Healthcare, USA.
- Address:  
P. A. Heasman  
School of Dental Sciences  
University of Newcastle upon Tyne  
Framlington Place  
Newcastle upon Tyne NE2 4BW, UK  
E-mail: p.a.heasman@newcastle.ac.uk

### Clinical Relevance

**Rationale:** Smoking and periodontal disease is an active area of research; an overview of the clinical evidence for smoking as a risk factor needs to be updated.

**Principal findings:** A wealth of evidence supports the fact that perio-

dontitis is more prevalent in smokers than non-smokers. The intermediate (between smokers and non-smokers) response to treatment of ex-smokers suggests that quitting the habit is of clinical benefit.

**Practical implications:** Quitting smoking and the response to the

hygiene phase of management necessitate behavioural change if long-term clinical success is to be achieved. The periodontist and hygienist are ideally positioned to effect such change.

This document is a scanned copy of a printed document. No warranty is given about the accuracy of the copy. Users should refer to the original published version of the material.