© 2006 The Authors. Journal compilation © 2006 Blackwell Munksgaard

ORAL MICROBIOLOGY AND IMMUNOLOGY

The effects of tetracycline, minocycline, doxycycline and ofloxacin on *Prevotella intermedia* biofilm

Takahashi N, Ishihara K, Kimizuka R, Okuda K, Kato T. The effects of tetracycline, minocycline, doxycycline and ofloxacin on Prevotella intermedia biofilm. Oral Microbiol Immunol 2006: 21: 366–371. © 2006 The Authors. Journal compilation © 2006 Blackwell Munksgaard.

Prevotella intermedia, a black-pigmented, anaerobic, gram-negative bacterium, is associated with various type of periodontitis. Antibiotic treatments via a systemic or local route have been reported as being useful for treating periodontal disease. The purpose of this study was to examine the effects of four antibiotics, tetracycline (TET), minocycline (MINO), doxycycline (DOXY) and ofloxacin (OFLX) on P. intermedia biofilms at minimum inhibitory concentrations (MIC) from one-fold to 100-fold. MICs were determined for planktonic cells. Biofilm formation was determined with the crystal violet stain method and the bioactivities in the biofilms were determined with the adenosine triphosphate (ATP) -bioluminescent assay using a 96-well culture plate. At one-fold MIC, DOXY inhibited biofilm formation by P. intermedia ATCC 25611. Other antibiotics at one-fold MIC had no effects on the biofilm formation of tested bacterial strains. In *P. intermedia* ATCC 25611 biofilms, all the antibiotics tested showed inhibitory activities at five- to 100-fold MICs. In the biofilms of P. intermedia strains, except ATCC 25611, treated with three tetracycline antibiotics, the bioactivities were significantly increased, indicating the difficulties involved in designing antibiotic therapy for periodontal disease.

N. Takahashi¹, K. Ishihara^{1,2}, R. Kimizuka^{1,2}, K. Okuda^{1,2}, T. Kato^{1,2} ¹Oral Health Science Centre and ²Department of Microbiology, Tokyo Dental College, Masago, Mihama-ku, Chiba, Japan

Key words: antibiotics; biofilm; periodontitis; *Prevotella intermedia*

Tetsuo Kato, Department of Microbiology, Tokyo Dental College, 1-2-2 Masago, Mihama-ku, Chiba 261-8502 Japan Tel.: +81 43 270 3742; fax: +81 43 270 3744; e-mail: tekato@tdc.ac.jp Accepted for publication May 2, 2006

In the oral cavity, multispecies biofilms are formed not only on tooth surfaces but also on soft tissue (11). More than 500 bacterial taxa have been observed from the oral cavity (11, 36). Dental plaque is a microbial biofilm formed by numerous organisms bound tightly to the tooth surface and is closely associated with the etiology of oral diseases such as dental caries and periodontitis (11, 16, 20, 27, 31).

Prevotella intermedia is a black-pigmented, anaerobic, gram-negative bacterium. It is frequently isolated from the periodontal lesions of patients with chronic periodontitis (2, 23, 34), aggressive periodontitis (1, 8, 13), puberty-associated gingivitis (19, 33), and acute necrotizing ulcerative gingivitis (22, 25). Furthermore, it has been reported that this bacterium relates to various systemic diseases such as acute exacerbation of chronic bronchitis (3), pulmonary infection (28) and atherosclerosis (6).

Systemic or local antibiotic therapies have been reported as being useful for treating periodontal disease (29, 30, 35). They reinforce mechanical cleansing therapies such as scaling, root planing, and/or open flap surgery. Especially tetracycline, as well as its derivatives minocycline and doxycycline, have been employed as local drug delivery systems (9, 18, 24, 26). The susceptibilities of biofilms to antimicrobial

agents differ from those of planktonic cultures of the same bacteria (5, 7). Wilson et al. (37) investigated Streptococcus sanguinis and found that cells in the biofilm were more resistant to both chlorhexidine gluconate and cetylpyridinium chloride than those in the planktonic form. Wright et al. (38) examined the in vitro effects of metronidazole on Porphyromonas gingivalis in both planktonic and biofilm cells and found that the minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) of cells was 160 times higher than that of planktonic cells. We investigated the effects of four antibiotics, tetracycline hydrochloride (TET). hydrochloride minocycline (MINO), doxycycline hyclate (DOXY)

and ofloxacin (OFLX), against *P. intermedia* biofilms in this study.

Materials and methods Bacterial strains and culture conditions

Р. intermedia ATCC 15032, ATCC 15033, ATCC 25611 and ATCC 49046 were used in this study. All strains were routinely grown on blood agar plates consisting of tryptic soy agar (Becton Dickinson Microbiology System, Cockeysville, MD) supplemented with 10% defibrinated horse blood, hemin (5 µg/ml; Sigma Chemical Co., St Louis, MO), and menadione (0.5 µg/ml; Wako Pure Chemical Industries, Osaka, Japan). Tryptic soy broth (TSB; Becton Dickinson Microbiology System) and BM medium, comprising 1% trypticase peptone (Becton Dickinson Microbiology System), 1% proteose peptone (Becton Dickinson Microbiology System), 0.5% yeast extract (Becton Dickinson Microbiology System) and 0.5% sodium chloride (32) supplemented with hemin and menadione were used. These were maintained under anaerobic conditions for at least 2 days before use. Culture was performed in an anaerobic chamber (N2 80%, H2 10%, CO2 10%) at 37°C

Antimicrobial agents and MIC determinations

Tetracycline hydrochloride (TET; Wako), and minocycline hydrochloride (MINO; Wako), doxycycline hyclate (DOXY; MP Biomedicals, LLC, Aurora, OH), and ofloxacin (OFLX; LKT Laboratories Inc., St Paul, MN) were used in this study. TET, MINO and DOXY were dissolved in BM medium. OFX was dissolved in 0.1 mol NaOH. When OFX was used, NaOH was added to the control wells (to a final concentration of <1 µmol).

MICs were determined from results performed at least three times. Aliquots (10 μ l) of *P. intermedia* strains that had been precultured for 18 h in 4 ml TSB were taken from a 2-day culture on blood agar plates, inoculated into 1 ml BM medium containing antibiotics at various concentrations and then incubated for 24 h. The MICs were determined as the lowest concentration of the antibiotic inhibiting visible growth of the bacteria.

Effects of antibiotics on the *P. intermedia* biofilms in the 96-well plates

Strains of *P. intermedia* were precultured, taken from the 2-day culture plate, for 18 h

growth process in the 96-well plate. To examine the effects of antibiotics on the P. intermedia biofilms on the 96-well plates, the antibiotics were added at onefold MIC, five-fold MIC, 10-fold MIC, 50fold MIC and 100-fold MIC. Effects of antibiotics on P. intermedia were evaluated as follows; after initial 24 h of culture ('0 h' in Figs 2 and 4) as described above, 100 µl of fresh BM medium was added to the wells and the plate was cultured for another 24 h ('24 h' in Figs 2 and 4). After this, culture medium (planktonic cells) was discarded from the well, and BM medium (200 µl) including the antibiotics at each concentration was added to biofilm-formed wells. After 24- or 48 h culture, biofilm formation was evaluated. Also, adenosine triphosphate (ATP)-bioluminescent assay was performed after P. intermedia biofilms had been cultured in a similar way.

Quantification of biofilms

Quantification of biofilms was achieved by using the protocol of Yamanaka et al. (39). Briefly, after the designated incubation time, the culture medium containing planktonic cells was removed, and the wells were washed with 200 μ l distilled water. The adherent bacteria were stained with 50 μ l 0.1% crystal violet for 15 min at room temperature. After rinsing with 200 μ l of distilled water twice, the dye bound to the biofilm was extracted with 200 μ l of 99% ethanol for 20 min. The extracted dye was then quantified by measuring the absorbance at 595 nm with a microplate reader (Model 3550; Bio-Rad Laboratories, Hercules, CA).

Evaluation of bioactivity

The bioactivities of P. intermedia cells in the biofilms were evaluated by an ATPbioluminescent assay using Kinshiro (TOYO B-Net Co. Ltd, Tokyo, Japan) according to manufacturer's instructions. Briefly, cultured P. intermedia cells were washed with the solution for ATP assay (50 mmol HEPES and 5 mmol MgSO₄, pH 7.75). Then an ATP extractant solution, Kinshiro LL100-2 (TOYO B-Net Co. Ltd), was added, and the mixture was allowed to react for 10 s. After the addition of a bioluminescent reagent, Kinshiro LL100-1 (TOYO B-Net Co. Ltd), bioluminescence was measured with a luminometer (Model Lumat LB9507, Berthold Technologies, Bad Wildbad, Germany) for 60 s. Control wells containing medium without bacterial cells were prepared to obtain a value for background luminescence.



Fig. 1. Biofilm formations of *P. intermedia* strains on 96-well plates. Aliquots (10 μ l) of cell suspension were inoculated into the wells of 96-well plates containing 90 μ l medium and the plates were incubated for the designated times. After incubation, biofilm formation was quantified. The experiments were performed more than three times, and each was conducted in triplicate.

368 Takahashi et al.

The relationship between ATP content and the number of viable bacteria in liquid aliquots was first examined using 18-h cultured *P. intermedia* ATCC 25611 cells in TSB. The cultures were diluted appropriately and ATP content and viable cell count [colony forming unit (CFU)/ml] were evaluated. After confirming the relationship, the number of viable cells of *P. intermedia* on the 96-well plate was then evaluated using the bioactivity.

Statistics

Each experiment using the 96-well plates was performed more than three times, with each conducted in at least triplicate. The Mann–Whitney *U*-test was used to identify statistically significant differences in the quantification of biofilms and the ATP-bioluminescence assay.

Results

Formation of *P. intermedia* biofilms on the 96-well culture plates

The formation of *P. intermedia* biofilms in $100 \ \mu$ l medium on the 96-well plates is

shown in Fig. 1. The biofilms of all strains used reached a plateau after 30 h of culture. The amount of *P. intermedia* ATCC 49046 biofilm was approximately twice that of other strains.

Effects of antibiotics on *P. intermedia* biofilm formation

The MICs for P. intermedia of all tested strains are shown in Table 1. Tetracyclines antibiotics and OFLX were effective against P. intermedia strains. The effects of antibiotics on the formation of P. intermedia biofilms on the 96-well plates were evaluated at 24 and 48 h. No distinct difference between 24-h and 48-h exposure was found (data not shown). The effects of antibiotics on P. intermedia biofilm formation at 24 h are shown in Fig. 2. OFLX at MICs from five-fold to 100-fold markedly inhibited biofilm formations of all P. intermedia strains tested. The P. intermedia ATCC 49046 biofilm had the lowest sensitivity among the tested strains against three tetracyclines antibiotics. TET and MINO at 50- and 100-fold MICs significantly increased the biofilm

formation of P. intermedia ATCC 49046 (P < 0.05). The biofilm formation of P. intermedia ATCC 25611 was inhibited by all the antibiotics used at MICs from five-fold to 100-fold. The biofilm formation of P. intermedia ATCC 15032 was inhibited by TET and MINO at MICs from five-fold to 100-fold. The biofilm formation of P. intermedia ATCC 15033 was inhibited by TET at a 100-fold MIC and by MINO at MICs from 10-fold to 100-fold. DOXY inhibited biofilm formation of P. intermedia ATCC 15032 at both 50and 100-fold MIC and of P. intermedia ATCC 15033 from 10- to 100-fold MIC. At a one-fold MIC, DOXY inhibited biofilm formation by P. intermedia ATCC 25611. Other antibiotics at a one-fold MIC had no effect on the biofilm formation of the tested bacterial strains.

Effects of antibiotics on bioactivities of *P. intermedia* biofilms

Quantification of biofilm formation using the crystal violet stain method does not reveal the actual bioactivity of the biofilms because crystal violet stains both live and



Fig. 2. Effects of antibiotics on *Prevotella intermedia* biofilm formation. The antibiotics were added at each concentration to *P. intermedia* biofilms formed on 96-well plates, and cultures were continued for a further 24 h. TET, MINO, DOXY and OFLX were added. The experiments were performed more than three times, and each was conducted in triplicate. The effects of antibiotics were analysed statistically using Mann–Whitney *U*-test, *P < 0.05 vs. control.

Table 1. MICs for P. intermedia strains

Strains	MIC (µg/ml)			
	TET	MINO	DOXY	OFLX
P. intermedia ATCC 15032	0.10	0.02	0.05	1.0
P. intermedia ATCC 15033	0.10	0.02	0.04	1.3
P. intermedia ATCC 25611	0.09	0.02	0.04	1.1
P. intermedia ATCC 49046	0.10	0.02	0.05	3.5

P. intermedia 10 ml was inoculated into BM medium containing each antibiotic and then incubated at 37°C in an anaerobic chamber for 24 h. The MICs were determined as the lowest concentration of antibiotic inhibiting visible growth of the bacteria. The experiments were performed at least three times.

dead cells. However, it is difficult to evaluate correctly the viable cells in biofilms because there is no appropriate method for releasing and dispersing cells from inside biofilms. Therefore, to determine the effects of these antibiotics on the bioactivities of the biofilms, the ATPbioluminescence assay was used in the present study. The relationship between ATP-bioluminescence and CFU is shown in Fig. 3. This result verified that quantification of ATP-bioluminescence reflected viable cell counts.

The effects of antibiotics on the bioactivities of *P. intermedia* biofilms on the 96-well plates are shown in Fig. 4. The bioactivities of *P. intermedia* ATCC 25611 biofilms were significantly suppressed by all of the antibiotics tested at MICs from five-fold to 100-fold (P < 0.05) except for DOXY at a five-fold MIC. OFLX suppressed the bioactivities of *P. intermedia* ATCC 15032 and ATCC 15033 biofilms but did not suppress the bioactivity of the ATCC 49046 biofilm. It was observed that the bioactivities of *P. intermedia* biofilms, except for strain ATCC 25611, were increased with three tetracycline antibiotics. Especially the bioactivities of *P. intermedia* ATCC 49046 biofilms were increased about twice greater than those of control groups.

Discussion

In the present study, we demonstrated the effects of antibiotics on P. intermedia biofilms at MIC levels up to 100-fold for planktonic cells. We chose TET, MINO, DOXY and OFLX in this study because they have been evaluated clinically for the auxiliary treatment of periodontitis associated with P. intermedia using a local drug delivery system (9, 10, 18, 24, 26). Our MIC results showed that MINO was the most effective antibiotic against planktonic P. intermedia cells. The other tetracycline antibiotics, TET and DOXY, also had strong effects while OFLX had moderate effectiveness. Our results agree well with previous investigations (14, 17).



Fig. 3. Relationship between ATP-content and CFU/ml. *P. intermedia* ATCC 25611 was cultured for about 18 h in 4 ml TSB. ATP content and viable cell count [colony-forming unit (CFU)/ml] were then measured in the cultures.

Biofilm bacteria exhibit a distinct mode of growth, which differs from that of planktonic cells (5, 7). Antibiotic resistance within biofilms changes in several microorganisms (4, 7). However, their susceptibilities have usually been evaluated using planktonic organisms. At a onefold MIC, none of the tested antibiotics, except DOXY on P. intermedia ATCC 25611, had an effect on biofilm formation. Furthermore none of them at one-fold MIC had an inhibitory effect on the tested biofilm. These results indicate that the MICs are not reliable predictors of the effects of antimicrobial agents against P. intermedia biofilms. In this study, no antibiotics were effective on P. intermedia ATCC 49046 biofilms. The following reasons for such resistance have been suggested generally (4, 7, 15): the antibiotics penetrate slowly or incompletely into biofilms; microbial nutrients and waste products modify the local environment inside biofilms; the growth rates of the bacteria decrease inside biofilms; and biofilm/attachment-specific phenotypes develop inside biofilms.

The ATP-bioluminescence assay has been reported to be useful for antibiotic susceptibility tests in bacterial biofilms (12, 21). Noiri et al. (21) investigated the in vitro effects of chlorhexidine, MINO and metronidazole against P. gingivalis biofilms using ATP-bioluminescence and showed that chlorhexidine was effective at reducing the bioactivity of P. gingivalis cells in biofilms compared to the other antibiotics tested. The bioactivity results were inconsistent with the results of biofilm formation. Possible reasons for the variations of ATP content could be changes in the number of viable bacterial cells or changes in the ATP content of individual bacterial cells. ATP plays a central role in the energy metabolism of the cell. Further investigations should be undertaken to elucidate how the changes of ATP content reflect cell condition, including the effects of antibiotics. The ATP-bioluminescence assay, however, would be useful to examine the reactions of biofilm bioactivities against antimicrobial agents. OFLX demonstrated inhibitory effects against both biofilm formation and bioactivity of P. intermedia strains, indicating that OFLX might have a significant effect against the biofilms.

The present study demonstrated changes in antibiotic susceptibility after biofilm formation in *P. intermedia*, however the magnitude of the change varied among the strains. The bioactivities were significantly increased in the biofilms of all the



Fig. 4. Effects of antibiotics on the activities of *Prevotella intermedia* biofilms. The antibiotics were added at each concentration to *P. intermedia* biofilms formed on 96-well plates, and cultures were continued for a further 24 h. TET, MINO, DOXY and OFLX were added. The experiments were performed more than three times, and each was conducted in triplicate. The effects of antibiotics were analysed statistically using Mann–Whitney *U*-test, *P < 0.05 vs. control.

P. intermedia strains tested, except ATCC 25611, when they were treated with three tetracycline antibiotics, which indicates the difficulty of designing antibiotic therapy for periodontal disease. To eradicate *P. intermedia* from subgingival plaque, bactericidal antibiotics such as OFLX would be appropriate.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported by Oral Health Science Centre grants 5A01 and 5A04 from the Tokyo Dental College and 'High-Tech Research Centre' Project for private Universities; matching fund subsidy from Ministry of Education, Cultures, Sports, Science and Technology, 2001–2005.

References

- Albandar JM, Brown LJ, Loe H. Putative periodontal pathogens in subgingival plaque of young adults with and without earlyonset periodontitis. J Periodontol 1997: 68: 973–981.
- Ashimoto A, Chen C, Bakker I, Slots J. Polymerase chain reaction detection of 8 putative periodontal pathogens in subgingi-

val plaque of gingivitis and advanced periodontitis lesions. Oral Microbiol Immunol 1996: **11**: 266–273.

- Brook I, Frazier EH. Immune response to *Fusobacterium nucleatum* and *Prevotella intermedia* in the sputum of patients with acute exacerbation of chronic bronchitis. Chest 2003: 124: 832–833.
- Costerton JW, Lewandowski Z, Caldwell DE, Korber DR, Lappin-Scott HM. Microbial biofilms. Annu Rev Microbiol 1995: 49: 711–745.
- Costerton JW, Stewart PS, Greenberg EP. Bacterial biofilms: a common cause of persistent infections. Science 1999: 284: 1318–1322.
- Fiehn NE, Larsen T, Christiansen N, Holmstrup P, Schroeder TV. Identification of periodontal pathogens in atherosclerotic vessels. J Periodontol 2005: 76: 731–736.
- Gilbert P, Das J, Foley I. Biofilm susceptibility to antimicrobials. Adv Dent Res 1997: 11: 160–167.
- Kamma JJ, Nakou M, Gmur R, Baehni PC. Microbiological profile of early onset/ aggressive periodontitis patients. Oral Microbiol Immunol 2004: 19: 314–321.
- Killoy WJ. Chemical treatment of periodontitis: local delivery of antimicrobials. Int Dent J 1998: 48: 305–315.
- Kimura S, Toda H, Shimabukuro Y et al. Topical chemotherapy in human periodontitis using a new controlled-release insert

containing ofloxacin. I. Microbiological observation. J Periodontal Res 1991: **26**: 33–41.

- Kolenbrander PE. Oral microbial communities: biofilms, interactions, and genetic systems. Annu Rev Microbiol 2000: 54: 413–437.
- Kumon H, Ono N, Iida M, Nickel JC. Combination effects of fosfomycin and ofloxacin against *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* growing in a biofilm. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 1995: **39**: 1038–1044.
- Kuru B, Yilmaz S, Noyan U, Acar O, Kadir T. Microbiological features and crevicular fluid aspartate aminotransferase enzyme activity in early onset periodontitis patients. J Clin Periodontol 1999: 26: 19–25.
- Lakhssassi N, Elhajoui N, Lodter JP, Pineill JL, Sixou M. Antimicrobial susceptibility variation of 50 anaerobic periopathogens in aggressive periodontitis: an interindividual variability study. Oral Microbiol Immunol 2005: 20: 244–252.
- Lewis W. Riddle of biofilm resistance. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 2001: 45: 999–1007.
- Marsh PD. Dental plaque as a microbial biofilm. Caries Res 2004: 38: 204–211.
- Miyake Y, Tsuruda K, Okuda K, Widowati, Iwamoto Y, Suginaka H. In vitro activity of tetracyclines, macrolides, quinolones, clindamycin and metronidazole against

periodontopathic bacteria. J Periodontal Res 1995: **30**: 290–293.

- Mombelli A, Tonetti M, Lehmann B, Lang NP. Topographic distribution of black-pigmenting anaerobes before and after periodontal treatment by local delivery of tetracycline. J Clin Periodontol 1996: 23: 906–913.
- Nakagawa S, Fujii H, Machida Y, Okuda K. A longitudinal study from prepuberty to puberty of gingivitis. Correlation between the occurrence of *Prevotella intermedia* and sex hormones. J Clin Periodontol 1994: 21: 658–665.
- Noiri Y, Li L, Ebisu S. The localization of periodontal-disease-associated bacteria in human periodontal pockets. J Dent Res 2001: 80: 1930–1934.
- Noiri Y, Okami Y, Narimatsu M, Takahashi Y, Kawahara T, Ebisu S. Effects of chlorhexidine, minocycline, and metronidazole on *Porphyromonas gingivalis* strain 381 in biofilms. J Periodontol 2003: 74: 1647– 1651.
- 22. Novak MJ. Necrotizing ulcerative periodontitis. Ann Periodontol 1999: 4: 74–78.
- Petit MDA, van Steenbergen TJM, Timmerman MF, de Graaff J, van der Velden U. Prevalence of periodontitis and suspected periodontal pathogens in families of adult periodontitis patients. J Clin Periodontol 1994: 21: 76–85.
- Polson AM, Garrett S, Stoller NH et al. Multi-center comparative evaluation of subgingivally delivered sanguinarine and doxycycline in the treatment of periodontitis. II.

Clinical results. J Periodontol 1997: 68: 119–126.

- Rowland RW, Mestecky J, Gunsolley JC, Cogen RB. Serum IgG and IgM levels to bacterial antigens in necrotizing ulcerative gingivitis. J Periodontol 1993: 64: 195–201.
- Saito A, Hosaka Y, Nakagawa T, Seida K, Yamada S, Okuda K. Locally delivered minocycline and guided tissue regeneration to treat post-juvenile periodontitis. A case report. J Periodontol 1994: 65: 835–839.
- Sbordone L, Bortolaia C. Oral microbial biofilms and plaque-related diseases: microbial communities and their role in the shift from oral health to disease. Clin Oral Investig 2003: 7: 181–188.
- Shinzato T, Saito A. A mechanism of pathogenicity of '*Streptococcus milleri* group' in pulmonary infection: synergy with an anaerobe. J Med Microbiol 1994: 40: 118–123.
- Slots J, Jorgensen MG. Effective, safe, practical and affordable periodontal antimicrobial therapy; where are we going, and are we there yet? Periodontol 2000 2002: 28: 298–312.
- Slots J, Ting M. Systemic antibiotics in the treatment of periodontal disease. Periodontol 2000 2002: 28: 106–176.
- Socransky SS, Haffajee AD. Dental biofilms: difficult therapeutic targets. Periodontol 2000 2002: 28: 12–55.
- Takahashi N, Saito K, Schachtele CF, Yamada T. Acid tolerance and acid-neutralizing activity of *Porphyromonas gingivalis*, *Prevotella intermedia* and *Fusobacterium*

nucleatum. Oral Microbiol Immunol 1997: 12: 323–328.

- Tsuruda K, Miyake Y, Suginaka H, Okamoto H, Iwamoto Y. Microbiological features of gingivitis in pubertal children. J Clin Periodontol 1995: 22: 316–320.
- 34. Van der Weijden GA, Timmerman MF, Reijerse E, Wolffe GN, Van Winkelhoff AJ, Van der Velden U. The prevalence of *A. actinomycetemcomitans*, *P. gingivalis* and *P. intermedia* in selected subjects with periodontitis. J Clin Periodontol 1994: **21**: 583– 588.
- van Winkelhoff AJ, Winkel EG. Systemic antibiotic therapy in severe periodontitis. Curr Opin Periodontol 1997: 4: 35–40.
- Whittaker CJ, Klier CM, Kolenbrander PE. Mechanisms of adhesion by oral bacteria. Annu Rev Microbiol 1996: 50: 513–552.
- Wilson M, Patel H, Fletcher J. Susceptibility of biofilms of *Streptococcus sanguis* to chlorhexidine gluconate and cetylpyridinium chloride. Oral Microbiol Immunol 1996: 11: 188–192.
- Wright TL, Ellen RP, Lacroix JM, Sinnadurai S, Mittelman MW. Effects of metronidazole on *Porphyromonas gingivalis* biofilms. J Periodontal Res 1997: **32**: 437– 477.
- Yamanaka A, Kimizuka R, Kato T, Okuda K. Inhibitory effects of cranberry juice on attachment of oral streptococci and biofilm formation. Oral Microbiol Immunol 2004: 19: 150–154.

This document is a scanned copy of a printed document. No warranty is given about the accuracy of the copy. Users should refer to the original published version of the material.